



TEXAS YOUTH AND GOVERNMENT

STATE AFFAIRS FORUM

Proposal Evaluation Form

Proposal Number: _____

Rate this proposal on the criteria listed below:

1 – POOR 2 - FAIR 3 - GOOD 4 – ABOVE AVERAGE 5 - EXCELLENT

Organization	1	2	3	4	5
Creative Approach to Problem	1	2	3	4	5
Realistic Proposal (Feasible)	1	2	3	4	5
Knowledge of subject	1	2	3	4	5
Proposal Presentation & Demonstration of Y Core Values	1	2	3	4	5
TOTAL _____					

YMCA CORE PRINCIPLES: Respect, Responsibility, Honesty, Caring



TEXAS YOUTH AND GOVERNMENT

STATE AFFAIRS FORUM

Proposal Evaluation Form

Proposal Number: _____

Rate this proposal on the criteria listed below:

1 - POOR 2 - FAIR 3 - GOOD 4 – ABOVE AVERAGE 5 - EXCELLENT

Organization	1	2	3	4	5
Creative Approach to Problem	1	2	3	4	5
Realistic Proposal (Feasible)	1	2	3	4	5
Knowledge of subject	1	2	3	4	5
Proposal Presentation & Demonstration of Y Core Values	1	2	3	4	5
TOTAL _____					

YMCA CORE PRINCIPLES: Respect, Responsibility, Honesty, Caring



TEXAS YOUTH AND GOVERNMENT

STATE AFFAIRS FORUM

Proposal Evaluation Form

Proposal Number: _____

Rate this proposal on the criteria listed below:

1 - POOR 2 - FAIR 3 - GOOD 4 – ABOVE AVERAGE 5 - EXCELLENT

Organization	1	2	3	4	5
Creative Approach to Problem	1	2	3	4	5
Realistic Proposal (Feasible)	1	2	3	4	5
Knowledge of subject	1	2	3	4	5
Proposal Presentation & Demonstration of Y Core Values	1	2	3	4	5
TOTAL _____					

YMCA CORE PRINCIPLES: Respect, Responsibility, Honesty, Caring



TEXAS YOUTH AND GOVERNMENT

STATE AFFAIRS FORUM

Proposal Evaluation Form

Proposal Number: _____

Rate this proposal on the criteria listed below:

1 - POOR 2 - FAIR 3 - GOOD 4 – ABOVE AVERAGE 5 - EXCELLENT

Organization	1	2	3	4	5
Creative Approach to Problem	1	2	3	4	5
Realistic Proposal (Feasible)	1	2	3	4	5
Knowledge of subject	1	2	3	4	5
Proposal Presentation- Demonstration of Y Core Values	1	2	3	4	5
TOTAL _____					

YMCA CORE PRINCIPLES: Respect, Responsibility, Honesty, Caring

Student Evaluation Rubric

Organization (Using Scale of 1-5)

- a. Did the delegate order his or her points understandably and appropriately?
- b. Did the delegate ensure his or her key message came across using strategies like repetition and visual aids?

Creative Approach to Problem (Using Scale of 1-5)

- a. Was the delegate's solution innovative and non-legislative?
- b. Did the delegate's use of visual aids strengthen his or her argument?

Realistic Proposal/Feasibility (Using Scale of 1-5)

- a. Did the delegate offer specifics regarding implementation of his or her proposal (e.g. cost, staff, etc.)?
- b. Did the delegate cite similar models that have addressed problems effectively and/or clearly explain the rationale for his or her approach to the problem?

Knowledge of Subject (Using Scale of 1-5)

- d. Was the delegate able to respond to other delegates' questions about his or her proposal with confidence and accuracy?
- e. Did the delegate effectively use answers to questions to reinforce his or her points?
- f. Did the delegate cite statistics, anecdotes, and/or other evidence in support of his or her proposal?

Proposal Presentation / Demonstration of Y Core Values (Using Scale of 1-5)

Did the delegate:

- i. Present confidently, make eye good eye contact, and use proper grammar?
- ii. Successfully utilize a visual aid to support their proposal? (Delegates must have a visual aid to accompany their proposal)
- iii. Truthfully provide evidence to support their proposal to the best of their ability?
- iv. Respond with appropriate sensitivity and care when approaching difficult topics?

Guidelines for (1-5) Scoring: The following represent general guidelines evaluators should apply to each category on the score sheet. It is strongly recommended that evaluators use "3" to indicate an average performance and adjust higher or lower for stronger or weaker performances.

1 — POOR PERFORMANCE

- ☐ Poor presentation
- ☐ Inadequate knowledge of proposal topic/SAF guidelines

2 — FAIR PERFORMANCE

- ☐ Awkward presentation
- ☐ Poise and delivery need more work

3 — GOOD PERFORMANCE

- ☐ Acceptable but uninspired presentation
- ☐ Needs more creativity and persuasiveness

4 — ABOVE AVERAGE PERFORMANCE

- ☐ Well organized; demonstrates thorough preparation
- ☐ Smooth, engaging, creative presentation

5 — EXCELLENT PERFORMANCE

- ☐ Demonstrates excellent preparation; well organized
- ☐ Presentation and ideas extraordinary and realistic, not overly rehearsed or memorized